Comparative Analysis Software Targets State of Strategic Planning of Tourism Industry of Kazakhstan

Botagoz MATAEVA 1; Zamira MUKHAMBETOVA 2; Nurlan TAZHBAYEV 3; Gaukhar KALKABAYEVA 4; Roza BESPAYEVA 5

Received: 12/10/2017 • Approved: 11/11/2017

Content
1. Introduction
2. Methods
3. Analysis
4. Discussions
5. Conclusion
References

ABSTRACT:
The analysis of the strategic and program documents of national and regional government bodies that regulate the development of the tourism industry. The estimation of maturity of these instruments with the use of score and expert assessment techniques "SMART". On the basis of this methodology evaluated the strategic and program documents of the Republic of Kazakhstan, given guidelines for the development of regional tourism development programs.

Keywords: the tourism industry, strategic and program documents, state strategic planning

RESUMEN:
El análisis de los documentos estratégicos y programáticos de los organismos nacionales y regionales que regulan el desarrollo de la industria turística. La estimación de la madurez de estos instrumentos con el uso de puntuación y técnicas de evaluación de expertos "SMART". Sobre la base de esta metodología se evaluaron los documentos estratégicos y programáticos de la República de Kazajstán, habida cuenta de las directrices para el desarrollo de programas regionales de desarrollo turístico.

Palabras clave: la industria turística, los documentos estratégicos y de programas, la planificación estratégica estatal

1. Introduction
For a long time, the development of the tourism industry was considered a panacea for society in a state of economic decline, and the tourism industry itself was viewed as an area that does
not bring anything to the public, except benefits. This approach was refuted after a series of studies demonstrating the existence of serious social, environmental and economic negative impacts on society and social development (Dogan, 1989; King, 1993; Mathieson, 1982; Wang, 1997). In 2003, US researchers conducted a study in which they demonstrated the impact of the tourism industry on all sectors and subsectors of the society’s economy (Goeldner, 2003). Tourists put a lot of pressure on the environment and on the lives of the local population: traffic density on the roads increases, crime increases, and the level of ecology decreases.

The Republic of Kazakhstan has a fairly high tourist and recreational potential. The republic has unique natural and recreational resources, objects of national and world cultural and historical heritage. The presence of a variety of tourist resources enable development of almost all the main types of tourism: beach, cultural, educational, business, active, wellness and eco-tourism (Resolution of the Government of the Republic of Kazakhstan, 2017).

The aim of this study is to study and evaluate the target indicators of strategic documents to determine the number of system areas, directly affecting the level of tourism development. However, no region can boast of attractive and affordable tourist facilities, are very popular with foreign tourists, in almost all regions of Kazakhstan do not have a developed tourist infrastructure.

In modern practice, the World Council of Travel and Tourism (WTTC) (World Travel & Tourism Council) and the World Tourism Organization (UNWTO) (2016) the effectiveness of the development of the tourism industry competitiveness index is determined by the travel and tourism sector. This index is calculated based on 70 indicators of three sub-indexes: regulatory framework sub index, the sub index of the business environment and infrastructure sub index of human, cultural and natural resources.

It is compiled every two years and covers 141 countries, and as is evident from Table 1, in 2015. Kazakhstan took the 85 place in the ranking.

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Table 1</th>
<th>Comparative analysis of the development of Kazakhstan's tourism industry to the world average</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>2013</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>The volume of services rendered placements mln. Tenge</td>
<td>59 714,1</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Scope of services for providing food and drinks, mln. Tenge</td>
<td>238 307,70</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>GDP, mln. Tenge</td>
<td>37 085 327,9</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>The share of the tourism industry in GDP,%</td>
<td>0,80</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Payroll number of employees of travel agencies</td>
<td>6,6</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>List number of workers of placements</td>
<td>50,4</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>List number of workers of sanatorium establishments</td>
<td>10,8</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Number of employees in Kazakhstan, thousand. People.</td>
<td>5949,7</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>The share of tourism professionals to the total number of employees, %</td>
<td>1.14</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>---</td>
<td>---</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Position of Kazakhstan in the Index of competitiveness of the sector of travel and tourism</td>
<td>141</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>The share of tourism in world GDP</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>The share of employment in the global tourism industry</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

*based on the source (Ministry of National Economy of the Republic of Kazakhstan, 2016)

In general, it is possible to agree with the expert opinion that the level of development of Kazakhstan's tourism industry lags far behind its potential. And it is possible to identify a number of paradoxical circumstances. In particular, the natural and climatic conditions favor the one hand as a fundamental factor of the tourist destination. This is primarily a wealth of flora and fauna, unique natural complexes and landscapes included in the UNESCO World Heritage List. They are the catalysts for the development of the tourism industry.

At the same time, the climatic conditions are the limiting factor in the development of the tourism industry. In particular, a large area of the country, long-distance, not long climatic season requires a global volume of investment in infrastructure.

Largely due to these circumstances the level of development of the country's tourism industry is still far from global trends. If the global GDP share of tourism is about 10%, while in Kazakhstan this figure, despite the dynamic growth has not reached 1%.

Similarly, we can talk about the share of employment in the tourism sector. According to estimates of the World Travel and Tourism Council in the global tourism industry employs 8%, in Kazakhstan just over 1% of employment in this field (Medetbekova, 2016).

Mild trends also affect the rating change. Kazakhstan 3 years significantly improved its position on the index of competitiveness of the sector of travel and tourism with 88 to 85 seats (Ministry of National Economy of the Republic of Kazakhstan, 2016; Travel & Tourism economic impact, 2016).

It should be noted that the tourism sector for 15 years, is officially one of the priorities of development of Kazakhstan's economy.

2. Methods

To date, there are different points of view on the strategic planning process. The researchers said that the emergence of strategic management techniques, use them in practice was due to the development of intra-organizational management systems, the growing instability of the external environment, as well as the conceptual evolution of strategic management.

In this article, a scientific method has been applied that is relevant to the problems posed, such as: the concept of "SMART".

3. Analysis

In Kazakhstan, a lot of effort was aimed at stimulating the development of the tourism industry. Initially, the development of tourism and hospitality is reflected in the concept of tourism development in the Republic of Kazakhstan dated March 6, 2001, was created by the Council for Tourism under the Government of the Republic of Kazakhstan, which today is an advisory body in the field of tourism development.
Within the framework of the State program for accelerated industrial-innovative development of Kazakhstan for 2010-2014, the tourist industry has been identified as a development priority. Regional master plans for development of tourism have been developed to promote entrepreneurial activity. A special economic zone "Burabay" was opened in Akmola region, which will be valid until December 1, 2017.

The Plan of the nation - 100 concrete steps to implement the five institutional reforms in tourism Nazarbayev paid enough attention:

- **step 57.** Attracting strategic (anchor) investors who have successful experience of creation of tourist clusters.
- **step 69.** The transformation of Astana in the business, cultural and scientific center of Eurasia, attracting researchers, students, businessmen and tourists from all over the region. At the same time the city will create a modern international transport and logistics system, including a new airport terminal.
- **86 step.** Development and implementation of large-scale project of the Assembly of People of Kazakhstan "Big Country - Big Family", which will strengthen the Kazakh identity and create conditions for the formation of an integrated civil community. All this work will be linked with the implementation of the Concept of development of the tourism industry in Kazakhstan till 2020 (taking into account the development of domestic tourism) and the creation of regional cultural tourism clusters: "Astana - heart of Eurasia", "Almaty - free cultural Kazakhstan area", "Unity of Nature and nomadic culture", "Pearl of Altai", "Revival of the Silk Road", "Caspian gates".
- **87 step.** Development and implementation of a national project to strengthen civic identity "Menin elim", under which provides for the implementation of technological projects series. One of them - creation of large-scale Internet project "Encyclopedia of Kazakhstan" with the main goal to help every citizen and foreign tourists to learn about the country more. The portal will be made available 3D tours of Kazakhstan, information about the history and culture of the country, interesting events and the lives of ordinary Kazakhs. The portal will be a kind of "calling card" of the country, a national guide, National Hall of Fame for interesting people and a platform for virtual communication.

In order to implement the President's Address to the Nation "Socio-economic modernization - main direction of development of Kazakhstan" in Kazakhstan have been developed:

- The master plan for the development of tourism industry in Astana in view of EXPO 2017;
- System Development Plan Burabay resort zone until 2020;
- Master plan of tourism cluster development program of the East Kazakhstan region;
- System Development Plan Almaty ski area;
- System Development Plan Kenderli resort area.

Currently, the main strategic document of the development of the tourism and hospitality industry of Kazakhstan is the concept of development of the tourism industry of the Republic of Kazakhstan till 2020, approved by Government Decision №508 of May 19, 2014.

It summarizes new approaches for the development of the tourism industry in Kazakhstan, primarily allocated 5 key tourism clusters:

- "Nature and Modernity" (Astana Schuchinsk-Burabay resort area);
- "World Wonders of Nature" (tourist potential of East Kazakhstan);
- "Urban tourism and recreation in the mountains" (ski resort near Almaty, Ile-Alatau State National Natural Park);
- "Heart of the Silk Road" (architectural and archaeological heritage of the South Kazakhstan oblast, Sairam-Ugam State National Natural Park);
- "Caspian Riviera" (Kenderli Resort).

Following to stimulate the tourism industry measures are provided for the implementation of cluster development of tourism:

**I. Measures to improve the legal framework:**

- The complex land-use ordering measures in specially protected areas (PAs), land of water and forest resources, to ensure the unimpeded opportunity for bona fide investors to build and manage the
tourism real estate while minimizing coordination, but with a clear process of environmental monitoring.

- The introduction of the new regime of special tourist zones, involving an investment cost of infrastructure, purchase of real estate by foreigners without a residence permit, the possibility of obtaining licenses for gambling establishments.
- The introduction of the state and the employer co-financing mechanism for the acquisition costs of employees of tourist services in Kazakhstan, including the nature of health as a tool for development of internal social tourism.
- The use of additional tax incentives tourism industry;
- The adoption of a set of measures of visa, border and immigration control, designed to simplify the planning and organization of foreign tourists travel to the country, including the organized mass tourists from key markets in Russia, China, Europe, India, the Middle East, as well as the citizens of the Member States OECD.
- Creation of a competitive environment for the development of the market of domestic flights, including the further development of domestic flights subsidy programs;
- set of measures to simplify the ownership of real estate by foreigners of tourism, as well as the introduction of new forms of shared ownership on tourist properties such as "timeshare".

II. Measures for the development of engineering and transport, tourism, and "soft" infrastructure and the improvement of the institutional structure.

List of objects of a regional transport infrastructure has been identified - airports; railway and auto stations; roads to be built or reconstructed in the framework of existing funding mechanisms.

Also to proposals for improving urban and intra-resort infrastructure, which will be financed from local budgets (information signs and signs, small architectural forms, etc.).

For the equity financing of tourist cluster development it proposes the creation of an operator in the face of a subsidiary of JSC "Samruk-Kazyna" for subordinate organizations MINT RK.

It is planned to implement all the measures in 3 stages:

1 Stage. Until 2016. adapt and create new legal and institutional mechanisms that will favor the development of the tourism industry in Kazakhstan. It is planned to acquire approximately 30.0% of all investments, it is about $ 2 billion. They should go for training and the start of construction of property, plant, and other major national projects in tourism. In addition, planned investments in the development of common tourism infrastructure, as well as to start the development of national tourism branding system in the international market.

The main expected results of the first phase of the increase in the flow of tourists is expected in the Concept to 4.1 million. Arrivals, an increase in the number of room nights sold to 13.3 million. Accordingly, revenues from the tourist activity is planned at the level of 4.6 billion. US dollars.

2 Stage - is the main stage for up to 2 years - 2017-2018gg. It is supposed to learn the order of 40-45% of all investments, which should go financing for the construction and placement of objects of tourist infrastructure in the development of national tourism projects.

The main expected results in this phase is planned to increase the flow of tourists to 6.5 million. Arrivals, the number of room nights sold to 23 million. Accordingly, revenues from the tourist activity is planned at the level of 7.6 billion. US dollars.

Stage 3 - the final stage, which will focus on the diversification of tourism products throughout Kazakhstan, development of small and medium-sized businesses in the tourism sector.

Expected results at this stage is planned for the following values: the number of tourists will be 8.5 million arrivals, the number of bed-nights 33.8 million. Accordingly, revenues from the tourist activity is planned at the level of 10.2 billion US dollars...

4. Discussions
Consider the expected results of the implementation of the Concept and their actual values from 2013 to 2015. Table 2 summarizes the overall expected results of the implementation of the Concept and the actual values from 2013 to 2015.

Table 2
Projected value concept and its realization on step 1

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th></th>
<th></th>
<th></th>
<th></th>
<th></th>
<th></th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>One-time capacity placements beds</td>
<td>92 053</td>
<td>109 331</td>
<td>109 094</td>
<td>124 609</td>
<td>118 355</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>The occupancy rate of placements, %</td>
<td>21.4</td>
<td>24.8</td>
<td>22.0</td>
<td>28.1</td>
<td>23.5</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Number of overnight stays of tourists, bed-days</td>
<td>7 186 444</td>
<td>10 979 809</td>
<td>7 212 995</td>
<td>14 773 174</td>
<td>7 017 070</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>The average length of stay of tourists, days</td>
<td>2.17</td>
<td>2.43</td>
<td>1.89</td>
<td>2.69</td>
<td>1.84</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2016</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2017</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2018</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2019</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2020</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>One-time capacity placements beds</td>
<td>140 887</td>
<td>157 166</td>
<td>173 444</td>
<td>189 722</td>
<td>206 000</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>The occupancy rate of placements, %</td>
<td>31.5</td>
<td>34.9</td>
<td>38.3</td>
<td>41.6</td>
<td>45</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Number of overnight stays of tourists, bed-days</td>
<td>18 566 539</td>
<td>22 359 905</td>
<td>26 153 270</td>
<td>29 946 635</td>
<td>33 740 000</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>The average length of stay of tourists, days</td>
<td>2.96</td>
<td>3.22</td>
<td>3.48</td>
<td>3.74</td>
<td>4</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

*based on the source (Ministry of National Economy of the Republic of Kazakhstan, 2016)

Thus, the completion of Phase 1 of the Concept of development of tourism in Kazakhstan, we can say is modest results of its implementation. This is confirmed by a slight increase in non-resident visitors entered the country.

Table 3
The number of visitors who entered the Republic of Kazakhstan

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th></th>
<th>2011</th>
<th>2012</th>
<th>2013</th>
<th>2014</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>The number of non-resident visitors who have entered the Republic of Kazakhstan, the man</td>
<td>5 685 132</td>
<td>6 163 204</td>
<td>6 841 085</td>
<td>6 332 734</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>including:</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>CIS countries</td>
<td>5 195 043</td>
<td>5 542 447</td>
<td>6 213 390</td>
<td>5 655 246</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
As can be seen, there has recently been a slight increase in the number of non-resident visitors who entered, with the main share - nearly 90% - falls on the CIS countries.

As seen in Figure 1, 3 CIS countries: Uzbekistan, Kyrgyzstan, and Russian Federation accounts for 5,303,373 people, or 71% visited Kazakhstan in 2015.

![Figure 1](image1.png)

*based on the source (Ministry of National Economy of the Republic of Kazakhstan, 2016)

The main motive of entry of citizens of CIS countries is labor. Kazakhstan's economy is typical labor-intensive type of development. Labor-intensive type of economy of Kazakhstan, as well as the active development of the country's construction sector, wholesale and retail trade, cause the growing demand for labor, for the most part have a low or average qualifications. It is also worth noting the country's agriculture, which accounts for 10% of GDP and development which is typical mainly extensive character development also increases the need for labor.

An important development in the migration processes in Kazakhstan and is the close proximity of Kazakhstan to the donor countries to the labor force.

According to geographical distribution should allocate more centers, attracting the largest number of migrant workers. This is the city of Astana (both due to the high level of wages, so due to large amounts of construction and installation work), Almaty (the financial and trade sector), the western region of Kazakhstan (the oil-producing regions - Mangistau, Atyrau region) and southern regions of the country, directly neighboring workforce donor countries (mainly agricultural regions).

If we look at trends in the entry of citizens from foreign countries, we can highlight the following. First, as highlighted certain leaders: China, Turkey and Germany (Figure 2)

![Figure 2](image2.png)

*based on the source (Statistical collections, 2016)
Together, these three countries accounted for 306,353 people, or 52% of all visitors to foreign countries.

The main motive of the same entry - labor migration.

As of January 1, 2016, the country operates 30 thousand 728 permits for foreign labor by employers (Most migrant workers come to Kazakhstan from China). At the same time most of the foreign workers involved in the construction sector - 20.8 thousand people, or 66.5 percent, in the mining industry - 2.3 thousand (7.4 percent), processing industry - 1.6 thousand (5.2 percent). 42.9 per cent of foreign workers - the specialists. In second place - skilled workers - 28.2 percent, the third - the heads of departments - 20.6 percent, in the fourth - the first heads and their deputies - 6.5 percent.

In order to protect the domestic labor market the Government of the Republic of Kazakhstan annually establishes a quota for the Republic of foreign experts. The size of the quota is constantly decreasing, from 2.4% of the economically active population in 2007 to 0.7% in 2016 (Statistical collections, 2016).

Thus, the main reason for visiting Kazakhstan is the labor migration that is not a direct result, demonstrating the success of the tourist industry.

It is obvious that in such a situation, the prospects of development of tourist industry of Kazakhstan is largely dependent on the state’s role in the tourism sector. It should be noted that since 2010, there has been quite active in the reorganization of the public administration system in the field of tourism. The level of the status of the central executive authorities for regulation and development of the tourism industry is gradually declining:

- The Ministry of Tourism and Sports of the Republic of Kazakhstan up to 2012;
- Committee of the tourism industry of the Ministry of Industry and New Technologies of the Republic of Kazakhstan up to 2014;
- Department of Tourism of the Ministry of Investment and Development of the Republic of Kazakhstan.

In our view, this part of the transformation of state regulation of tourism sphere has caused a number of problems associated with the lack of a clear understanding of development priorities and frankly effectively prevented the development of tourism in Kazakhstan.

Proof of this is the comparison of the results outlined in the Strategic Plan of the Ministry of Investment and Development of Kazakhstan for 2014-2018 years, approved by order of the
As the table shows, the actual data to 2015, target indicator for servicing non-resident placements already surpassed and exceeded the planned level of 2018 by 17%, and the second target indicator of the actual level of 2015 exceeds the planned value in 2016.

In this case we recall that the concept of development of the tourism industry of the Republic of Kazakhstan till 2020 was approved by the Government of the Republic of Kazakhstan for six months earlier, and it is planned entirely different other values. In 2018 the concept intended to 6.5 million. Arrivals, which is almost 2 times higher than planned level of the same indicator of the Department of Tourism of the Ministry of Investment and Development of the Republic of Kazakhstan in the strategic plan.

The strategic objective relating to the tourism industry, funded by the budget program 088 "Forming the national tourism product and promote it on the international and domestic market" with an annual funding of 219.1 million tenge. Indicators of direct result of the fiscal program are shown in Table 5.
In general, the activities of the Department comes to participation in international tourism exhibitions. According to the progress report for 2015 of the Department of Tourism Industry Kazakhstan's participation was organized in 2015 in the number of international tourist exhibitions: ITB (Berlin), "ITM" (Moscow), the ATM (Dubai), of ITE (Hong Kong), PATA Travel Mart-2015 (Bangalore), JATA-2015 (Tokyo), WTM (London) (Department of Tourism Industry, 2016).

December 14, 2015 signed a Memorandum of Understanding between the Ministry of Investment and Development of the Republic of Kazakhstan and the State Administration of Tourism's Republic of China on the simplification of group tourist trips of Chinese citizens in the Republic of Kazakhstan. This will help increase the flow of tourists from the PRC.

Among the tourist activities on the domestic tourism should be noted the organization in April 2015 Kazakhstan International Tourism Exhibition "KITF" in Almaty, held in May 2015. Annual Ile-Balkhash regatta, holding the republican seminar-workshop on "Effective participation in exhibitions" in September 2015 «Astana Leisure 2015».

For a more detailed evaluation of the Department of Tourism Industry of the Ministry of Investment and Development of the Republic of Kazakhstan use fairly well-known in the practice of management «SMART» concept, which assumes that any goal that we have set, or with which we work, must be (Korchanov, 2016):

- Specific (concrete);
- Measurable (measurable);
- Attainable (achievable);
- Relevant (realistic);
- Time-bound (a certain time).

According to this method, the experts were asked to evaluate the strategic objective, target indicators and indicators of the Department of Tourism Industry of the Ministry of Investment and Development of the Republic of Kazakhstan and assigned to 10-point scale. As experts of 10 people were selected: 5 experts from among the employees of the tourism industry, 3 experts from among the teaching staff of universities, teaching for undergraduate specialty "Tourism", 2 experts from among civil servants. The evaluation criteria are shown in Table 6.

### Table 6

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Evaluation Criteria</th>
<th>Determination of the final grade (FG)</th>
<th>The maximum score FG</th>
<th>Range FG</th>
<th>Level</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Estimation of target indicators and indicators of problems on SMART criteria</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
Each target indicator and the indicator of the tasks is estimated by experts according to criteria SMART:

- **Specific**
- **Measurable**
- **Attainable**
- **Relevant**
- **Time-bound**

FG It is defined as the arithmetic mean

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>FG</th>
<th>Unsatisfactory</th>
<th>Satisfactory</th>
<th>Average</th>
<th>Good</th>
<th>Great</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>FG &lt; 30</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>30 &lt; FG &lt; 40</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>40 &lt; FG &lt; 45</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>45 &lt; FG &lt; 48</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>FG Î (49, 50)</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

*prepared by the authors

As the table shows the maximum total score of 50 points, as the value of all the criteria is the same. The options range and level IO:

- at least 30 - the level of public authority activity is assessed as unsatisfactory, indicating that the error of the main provisions and activities;
- from 30 to 40 - the level of activity is assessed as poorly satisfactory, there are issues of fragmentation of activities, non-logic and completeness of the solution to the problem;
- from 40 to 45 points - the level of activity is assessed as satisfactory, it is characterized as doing the minimum necessary requirements, observed minor deviations from the strategic goal;
- from 45 to 48 points - the level of activity is assessed as good, System and deeply covers all areas of the industry;
- from 49 to 50 points - the level of activity is assessed as excellent, characterized by a maximum performance of all the necessary requirements

Table 7 shows the results of an expert evaluation indicators of the Department of Tourism Industry of the Ministry of Investment and Development of the Republic of Kazakhstan industry.

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Specific</th>
<th>Measurable</th>
<th>Attainable</th>
<th>Relevant</th>
<th>Time-bound</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>target indicators</td>
<td>6,3</td>
<td>8,1</td>
<td>9,6</td>
<td>3,2</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Direct indicators of problems</td>
<td>3,4</td>
<td>6,2</td>
<td>9,7</td>
<td>2,4</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Average</td>
<td>4,9</td>
<td>7,2</td>
<td>9,7</td>
<td>2,8</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>final grade</strong></td>
<td><strong>30,1</strong></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

*compiled by the author based on calculation

As can be seen from the table, unfortunately, the level of activity of the Ministry of Tourism Industry Department for Investments and Development of the Republic of Kazakhstan is estimated by experts to be poorly satisfactory.

Moreover, in quantitative terms, the final assessment of barely passed for border unsatisfactory assessment of activity of the state body – only a tenth points.

The lowest evaluation activities indicators of the Department of Tourism Industry of the Ministry of Investment and Development of the Republic of Kazakhstan received on the appropriateness and validity of the chosen strategic orientations. In other words, we can say about the neglect
5. Conclusion

As it is known, aims and objectives of tourism policy depend on the prevailing economic, political and social conditions in the tourism industry. Under the current policy, we can conclude that at the moment tourism is a priority development only on paper; strategic indicators and indicators of tourism development do not correspond to the reality and potential of the tourism industry. And as we can see, the various indicators of program documents are often not interconnected and contradict each other.

Based on the stated in the Concept of the strategic guidelines of the tourism industry, we can identify a number of areas of the system, directly affecting the level of tourism development. In particular, we show enlargement in certain areas:

- Competitive tourist destination in the international tourism market.
- The development of tourism on the regional or local level.
- Development of a cluster network approach in the organization of tourist products

5.1. Competitive tourist destination in the international tourism market

Any State which entered the international tourism market, enter into competition with other states. The way travel policy conducted in the country, how effective it is and how it is implemented depends on the position of the state on the international tourism market. In this direction, Kazakhstan needs to clearly define the niche segment and in the international tourism market and develop a strategic action plan in this area.

5.2. The development of tourism on the regional or local level

Many investment projects in the field of development of regional tourism products remains unrealized due to lack of transparency in this sphere, the big influence of infrastructural factors. In this regard, we believe each region on forces to develop and organize regional tourist products to satisfy the domestic demand for tourism and recreation in the area of youth tourism, social tourism, amateur sports tourism, etc.

5.3. The development of the cluster network approach in the organization of tourist products

Concept allocated 5 major tourism clusters. In the form in which they are currently in operation, they can not be called a cluster. Rather, it can be called Proto, ie territory potentially capable of fulfilling tourist function. Each cluster should have the possibility of creating a special tourist brand, as well as to perform specific functions in the regional tourism and recreation system, stand by their views of tourism and recreation. For this purpose, it is necessary in each potential tourist cluster, in our opinion, to carry out tourist zoning and its results to develop a clustering strategy.

Adding to the proposed changes in the basic provisions, principles, system parameters and algorithm of the rating activity of central and local executive bodies on the development of tourism will improve the competitiveness of tourist clusters at national and regional levels.

References


1. Candidate of Economic Sciences. Professor of Department of Chair of Tourism and restaurant business. Karaganda Economic University Kazpotrebsoyuz. Karaganda, Kazakhstan. bmataeva@yahoo.com
2. Candidate of Economic Sciences. Associate Professor of Department of Chair of Economics and Entrepreneurship. Karaganda Economic University Kazpotrebsoyuz. Karaganda, Kazakhstan. zamira250172@mail.ru
3. Candidate of Economic Sciences. Associate Professor of Department of Chair of Information and Computing Systems. Karaganda Economic University Kazpotrebsoyuz. Karaganda, Kazakhstan. TNM_1977@mail.ru
4. Candidate of Economic Sciences. Associate Professor of Department of Chair of Banking. Karaganda Economic University Kazpotrebsoyuz. Karaganda, Kazakhstan. aisanatazhbaeva@mail.ru
5. PhD, Department of Chair of Management and Innovation. Karaganda Economic University Kazpotrebsoyuz. Karaganda, Kazakhstan. brs_@mail.ru